



**CITY OF KETCHUM  
PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION MEETING  
March 10, 2014, 5:30 p.m.  
Ketchum City Hall Meeting Room, Ketchum, Idaho**

**Present:** Chairperson Deborah Burns  
Vice-Chairperson Richard Fabiano  
Commissioner Steve Cook  
Commissioner Mike Doty  
Commissioner Jeff Lamoureux

**Also Present:** Ketchum City Attorney Stephanie Bonney  
Ketchum Planning Manager Joyce Allgaier  
Ketchum Senior Planner Rebecca Bundy  
Ketchum Recording Secretary Sunny Grant

**1. Chairperson Deborah Burns opened the Regular Planning and Zoning meeting at 5:30 p.m.**

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ISSUES NOT ON THE AGENDA**

There was no public comment at this time.

**3. PUBLIC HEARING upon the application of A.W.E. LLC, for a conditional use permit (CUP) for office use in the Tourist (T) zoning district, at 460 First Street East (Lot 8, Block 21, Ketchum Townsite). To be continued to a date certain.**

Chairman Deborah Burns moved to continue the PUBLIC HEARING upon the application of A.W.E. LLC, for a conditional use permit (CUP) for office use in the Tourist (T) zoning district, at 460 First Street East (Lot 8, Block 21, Ketchum Townsite) to April 14, 2014. Motion seconded by Commissioner Rich Fabiano, and passed unanimously.

**4. PUBLIC HEARING upon the application of the City of Ketchum and Alex Higgins for the rezoning of Lots 1, 2, 3 and 4 of Block 67, Ketchum Townsite (691 Second Avenue North) to rezone the property from General Residential – Low Density (GR-L) to General Residential – High Density (GR-H). Continued to April 14, 2014.**

Chairman Deborah Burns moved to continue the PUBLIC HEARING upon the application of the City of Ketchum and Alex Higgins for the rezoning of Lots 1, 2, 3 and 4 of Block 67, Ketchum Townsite (691 Second Avenue North) to April 14, 2014. Motion seconded by Commissioner Steve Cook, and passed unanimously.

**5. CONSIDERATION upon the application of Greg and Cari Strimple for CONSIDERATION of Community Core Design Review – Multifamily Home in the Community Core, Subdistrict C, Urban Residential zoning district AND Townhouse Subdivision Preliminary Plat consideration at 171 East Avenue South (Ketchum Townsite Lot 7A, Block 22) for a two (2) unit townhouse development.**

*Also Present: Applicant Cari Strimple  
Project architect Dan Fletcher  
Project representative Thad Farnham  
Project civil engineer, Garth McClure*

Commissioner Rich Fabiano was not present for the first public hearing on this application, but has read the material and understands the application. Staff said he did not need to recuse himself from the discussion since he is familiar with the Design Review Standards in the Community Core.

**DISCLOSURE:** Commissioner Steve Cook said he owns property in the immediate area, but that won't bias his analysis of the project.

Ketchum Senior Planner Rebecca Bundy said the Planning and Zoning Commission previously heard this application on February 24, 2014. P&Z felt the design generally met the criteria of the Chapter 17.64 Community Core Zoning District, but asked the applicant to reconsider some design elements.

5:37:53 PM Project architect Dan Fletcher said he minimized as much as possible the mass of the proposed building to be sensitive to surrounding smaller buildings. Plan revisions include:

- Pushed the building back on the site as far as possible and still maintain parking in front of garages without intruding into the alley. Radii have been eased for vehicular access into the garages.
- moved the second floor bay windows to the first floor to create an identifiable first floor massing element.
- Lowered the beam over the entry court so it lines up with the top of the bay windows to create a horizontal line above the bays.
- Introduced texture at the second story level, eliminating vertical cement plaster element.
- Exterior materials have been given more depth and definition.
- Scaled back roof overhangs.
- Simplified siding elements and no longer use metal.
- Revised color scheme to be more monochromatic.
- Horizontal elements have been run around the entire building to break down the scale. No element is more than two stories tall.
- Eliminated raised planters in front of the building, and, with the building pushed back, the landscape architect can do more with the ground available. Swedish aspen trees (30 feet tall and about five feet diameter) can be planted along the sides of the building.
- Maximum height of the building is 36'-6" for about 25% of the entire roof area. The remainder of the roof height is 32'-6" or less.

**COMMISSIONER COMMENTS/QUESTIONS:** 5:45:46 PM

- *Dry well drainage?* Project representative Thad Farnham said Ketchum Street Superintendent Brian Christiansen was fully satisfied that a 14 foot deep, 2 foot diameter drywell would accommodate all water from the lot and the alleyway north of it. Bundy confirmed that the Ketchum Street Superintendent was satisfied with this design; and also satisfied that an easement would give the City the right to access the drywell if needed.

5:48:33 PM Project representative Garth McClure said that his firm's civil engineer had done a calculation on the drywell to be sure the sizing is appropriate for the area that needs to be covered—the building itself, water off the roof, alley and the entire lot.

- *Grading in the alley?* McClure said they added a swale in the pavement that is now on their Site Grading and Drainage Plan. The swale runs the length of Lot 8A and is directed into the catchbasin at the northwest corner of the lot and into the drywell. The drywell is located to provide required separation to the existing water line located in the alley.
- 5:52:19 PM *With Swedish aspens and fir trees on the side, will there be adequate room to access the side door to the garage?* No.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Neighbor Tracy Lee said the applicant had done a nice job of addressing most issues raised at the previous meeting. She asked if the applicant could provide a visual of their proposed building as it relates to the neighborhood to address how its bulk and scale fit within the context of the neighborhood.
- Neighbor John Lee questioned the drainage to the north, especially since the alley has been puddled the last few weeks.

Bundy said drainage runs to the east into a swale. McClure said it then drains south along that side of the alley, goes into a catchbasin and is piped into the drywell.

#### COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

- Commissioner Lamoureux said the two percent slope across the alley forms one side of the swale. He asked how well defined the swale was and how deep the water would be in the swale. How much of an abrupt change will there be for vehicles driving through the alley? How far will water back up into private property, which looks to be quite flat. Lamoureux suggested a catchbasin in the alley as well. 5:58:39 PM McClure said the alley is crowned 2-3% so water will drain onto both sides.
- Commissioner Lamoureux said the cross slope was 2%. The longitudinal slope from Second Street toward the proposed property was 1.2% and he wasn't sure it would drain as planned without seeing the grades on Lot 8A. He didn't want water going into the existing shed on the neighboring property. McClure said they could add some topography on Lot 8A and that it is a tough alley because there is little ground depth over the existing Ketchum Spring Water Line.
- Lamoureux asked neighbor John Lee to explain how water drains in the area. Lee said it drains to the north. If it is designed to drain south, the applicant will have to cut into the grade, which could affect the existing spring water line, or raise the whole alley which would push the water puddle out into the street. The more the alley is raised, the more it will affect the garage. Commissioners suggested more drainage study.

6:04:19 PM Planning Manager Joyce Allgaier said staff would be sure the City engineer/public works director reviewed the plans. She said Condition 6 required a revised civil engineer plan, and Condition 8 addresses the alley. Lamoureux suggested that the conditions specifically require that the alley water does not create standing water on the adjacent property and that they make sure there is positive drainage in the alley.

- Commissioners suggested the City Engineer review the City's Code and need for a sand/oil separator into sanitary sewers as well as the drywell. Allgaier said this could be part of building permit review.



P&Z Commissioners asked the applicant to display a rendering of the proposed building surrounded by homes in the neighborhood.

- [6:12:01 PM](#) Commissioners noted that the depiction only showed the two houses on either side of the proposed building. There are other homes of different sizes behind and in the immediate neighborhood.
- Chairman Burns said it would be important to plan the construction staging area in this neighborhood. Farnham said they were required to meet with City departments to keep vehicles to a minimum, and they will have to describe where they will store materials. They plan to have construction workers carpool and will have materials dropped at the front of the site. They will be working through the alley quite a bit with heavy equipment, and will be cognizant of the spring water line. Farnham said other projects in the area have used the center parking areas in the street for staging.
- [6:13:53 PM](#) Commissioner Cook said this was a critical parking area for the city in the summer, and that the sidewalk would require pedestrian protection.
- Commissioner Fabiano said the proposed development was an attractive building, and the applicant had done great job of addressing issues except for building scale. He said he was struggling with whether the building fit the neighborhood.
- Commissioner Cook said he understood the difficulty of the site. He couldn't overlook massing and bulk, and was struggling with the issue of compatibility with the townscape and surrounding neighborhood.
- Commissioner Doty said the proposed building was a square peg in a round hole, but met criteria, height limits and setbacks of Ketchum's Zoning Ordinance. He didn't think P&Z should penalize an applicant for a project because it was being compared to nonconforming structures.
- Commissioner Cook felt the building could be softened and brought more into scale.
- Chairman Burns said this neighborhood had become representative of the "old feeling" of Ketchum, and there weren't many neighborhoods like that left. She said the proposed building was beautiful but felt awkward here, and she would have a hard time approving it.
- Commissioner Lamoureux said the building met Code, and he appreciates the applicant's efforts to address concerns. The Code contemplates the whole neighborhood, and there are several buildings of this mass and scale in the same neighborhood that are adjacent to smaller buildings. Part of Ketchum's eclectic appeal is to have both. Lamoureux said he thought the design meets what is contemplated in the Code; and the City needs to provide developers with predictability in the Code.
- Commissioner Fabiano said the City has Codes and P&Z has rules and regulations to follow, but the building is going to stand out and he would love to see the form softened.

Commissioner Steve Cook started to make a motion to deny the project, but decided to not complete his motion.

[6:26:38 PM](#) **Commissioner Jeff Lamoureux moved that this project does meet standards for approval under Chapter 17.64 of the Ketchum Code Title 17 only if Conditions of Approval 1 through 16 are met, as amended by discussion at tonight's meeting and possibly amended by further discussion of the drainage plan. Motion seconded by Commissioner Michael Doty. Commissioners Deborah Burns and Steve Cook opposed the motion. Commissioner Rich Fabiano recused himself since he was not present for the first consideration of this**

application. Commissioners Michael Doty and Jeff Lamoureux were in favor of the motion. Motion to approve the project did not pass, but did not fail..

Staff asked the applicant if they would prefer to come back and further address concerns instead of having the project denied. Jim Lasky, on behalf of the applicant, said the design meets the Zoning Code.

6:29:31 PM City Attorney Stephanie Bonney said P&Z had to tell the applicant what to do in order to get the project approved. Allgaier said the applicant had designed the west end of the building to provide variety, and could modify the north and south sides of the building to reduce their verticality. The back of the building is okay. This is an eclectic neighborhood and will change. Infill buildings are likely to be larger and provide more compatibility with this project. The Code encourages high density and vitality in the Community Core.

City Attorney Bonney said the P&Z can't require compatibility with non-conforming buildings. Dan Fletcher, representing the applicant, said they accepted denial of the application. It was a very challenging design, but the Code encourages density.

6:36:15 PM City Attorney Bonney suggested the applicant stay their townhouse plat subdivision application.

**6. CONSIDERATION of Pre-Application Design Review by Ketchum Partners LLC, at Sun Valley Athletic Club Subdivision, Lot 1A (131 First Avenue South) to construct a seven (7) unit attached two (2) story townhouse development, in the Community Core (CC) Zoning District, Sub-district C.**

*Also present: Project architect Brenda Moczygemba*

Commissioner Michael Doty recused himself from this application since his firm represents the applicant.

Commissioner Fabiano told the applicants that pre-application is a discussion about the project; and that things suggested on the conceptual design are not necessarily agreed to during Design Review of the project at a later date.

Ketchum Senior Planner Rebecca Bundy said the proposed project was a seven-unit attached townhouse development. Staff and City department heads' comments and concerns were:

- Site and roof drainage.
- Plans from a civil engineer will be required for sidewalk and alley improvements. A high spot in the existing alley will need to be regraded and paved.
- Street trees and street amenities, streetlights, bike racks, etc.
- The City arborist is fine with the proposed site plan.
- The Fire Chief will have to review fire sprinkling.
- The project provides more than adequate parking. Proposed parking is 12 spaces on site, a side-by-side 2-car garage and the rest are tandem-park and single car garages, and credit for 12 spaces on the street.
- Municipal Code Section 12 and Community Core Building Type 4 (Multi-Family Home) require a 5 foot wide sidewalk, curb and gutter. Trees can be placed on private property, adjacent to the public sidewalk. Sidewalks wider than 5 feet are encouraged where possible.

- The project slightly exceeds the 1.0 Floor Area Ratio, but the applicant will reduce the FAR in the Final Design to 1.0.
- The project has front “stoops” that are not fully roofed. Ketchum’s Façade Elements standard requires a front porch for all building entrances fronting a street, avenue, or public plaza. Staff has no issue with any other site or façade specifications.
- External chimneys may extend out up to two feet in side and rear setback zones, but are prohibited on all facades fronting a street, avenue, park or public plaza. The applicant has pulled the chimneys into the interior of the building to meet the criteria, but there is a large vertical stone element on the street façade.
- There are some exterior elements that define horizontality, but there are also unbroken vertical elements.

Project architect Brenda Moczygamba said the lot is at the corner of First Street and First Avenue, adjacent to Forest Service Park. The proposed project will have a ramp that drops six feet below ground to a motor court. Every unit has a private garage. There is a landscaped planter in the center of the motor court and landscaping between each garage door. Commissioner Cook suggested the planter might cause circulation problems with the electrical and meter base. The applicant responded that there is a full 24 feet of back-out room in front of each garage door.

Sidewalks will be improved, and applicant is working with the engineers to increase them to 8 feet. First Avenue will remain a 5 foot wide sidewalk. There will be new curb and gutter along First Street and First Avenue. Every unit has an entry porch that is 3 or 4 feet above sidewalk grade, depending on existing grade.

7:08:28 PM The ramp down to the motor court and sidewalks will be heated.

The roof has a hip gable along the perimeter, with other protruding hip gables, gable and double gable forms to help break up the mass of the building. The gables convert serve as guardrails for the roof decks. Ketchum Code prohibits chimneys on exterior walls fronting a public street, plaza or park, so the chimneys are recessed into the exterior wall to provide a vertical stone feature. Senior Planner Bundy said the applicant is meeting the Code and still providing a visual exterior element.

Moczygamba described exterior elements. Siding will likely be a vertical brown-tone plank. Primary accent siding will be a stucco material. Primary and secondary exterior elements extend out 1 to 3 feet and include porches and gables. Roofing is asphalt composition shingle.

- Trash will be stored in auto carts, not a dumpster.
- Double high space in living areas, with lots of glass looking out onto the street, will provide light and views.

Commissioners’ and applicant’s comments:

- Could the east elevation be softened with a trellis or something off the staircase?
- Could chimney elements on the north elevation be softened a little where they break the roof plane?
- Total building height is shorter than the directly adjacent building and fairly consistent with other neighbor buildings.
- Chimney caps are a little obvious.



- Building will be reduced to 1.0 FAR. The FAR calculation includes space that should not be considered floor space.
- The applicant wants to promote views from the rooftop deck.

Chairman Deborah Burns left the meeting at this time.

- [7:25:51 PM](#) Current Code requires fireplaces to be internal. The applicant would like to orient seating arrangements facing the windows, but locating the fireplace to interior would put it to the occupants' backs.
- The exterior façade "in and out" is great.
- Drainage goes across from the Residences at Evergreen. The applicant will have a fully-engineered plan at Design Review.
- The building will meet National Green Building Standard, probably gold. Commissioner Lamoureux suggested the snowmelt system be served by alternative energy.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- Written comment was received from Frank and Linda Moore expressing concerns.
- [7:37:33 PM](#) Jeannie Dahl, a resident on the first floor of the Residences at Evergreen, asked if the motor court would be in her view. Moczygemba said it was 6 feet below the level of the alley, where Evergreen residences entered their covered parking area. The motor court and a 1x6" strip in front will be landscaped and planted.

**7. CONSENT AGENDA**

- a. **FINDINGS OF FACT: Barrow – Variance Denial**
- b. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES: January 27, 2014**

**Commissioner Steve Cook moved to approve the Consent Agenda for March 10, 2014. Motion seconded by Commissioner Michael Doty, and passed unanimously.**

**8. [7:42:36 PM](#) COMMISSION COMMENTS**

- Commissioners Fabiano and Doty said the Code should be reviewed regarding chimneys on exterior walls.
- P&Z is allowed to make concessions on height. They should be able to make concessions on square footage for FAR calculations.
- [7:43:38 PM](#) Commissioners expressed concern that the Strimple project would appeal to Council. City Attorney Bonney said the applicant could ask Council to remand the application back to P&Z for additional consideration. The applicant could have shown the proposed building in the context of the full city block, instead of just the two adjacent properties. Staff said two weeks was not enough time for an applicant to adequately present a revised design.
- Staff and Commissioners need better engineering calculations, so Commissioners can identify potential issues for the City and neighbors. [7:56:35 PM](#)
- More attention should be paid to potential pollutants in the storm drainage system.

**10. ADJOURNMENT**

**Commissioner Rich Fabiano moved to adjourn the meeting at 7:57 p.m. Commissioner Michael Doty seconded the motion, and it passed unanimously.**



---

Chairperson Deborah Burns

CC: City Council